

Evaluators Scores

Criterion	Abbreviated Description	Points Available	A	B	C	D	E	Comments
						30		GNF legal access?
1.a	Describe location and legal access	30	30	20	30		30	
1.b	Identify source of water	10	5	10	10	8	5	
						69.2		173/10 x 4 = only 69, but good pilot project?
1.c	Quantify conserved or new water	4/10 af to 500	69	69	69		69	Low score due to 1.c, but good project; NM needs watershed treatment data from all forest veg types
1.d	Meets AWSA and CUFA	30	30	10	30	30	30	
2.a	Technical and engineering studies and support	20	20	20	20	20	20	
2.b	hydro, ecologic, geotec support	20	20	20	20	20	20	
3.a	Quantify est. planning/const. costs	10	10	10	10	10	10	
3.b	Quantify ongoing admin, O&M costs	10	10	10	10	10	10	
3.c	Quantify enviro compliance and costs	10	5	8	10	10	10	
3.d	Quantify AWSA funding sought for life of project	10	10	10	10	10	10	
4.a	Describe and quantify enviro impacts, listed species	10	5	10	10	10	8	Increased water yield not help ecology?
4.b	How mitigaste above	10	5	8	10	10	10	
4.c	How benefit environment	10	5	10	10	10	10	
4.d	List enviro statutes, regulations, how would comply	10	5	8	10	10	6	BMPs not mentioned
5.a	Estimate economic benefits	10	5	7	10	10	8	
5.b	Estimate costs for planning, design, enviro, admin, etc.	10	10	10	10	10	10	
5.c	Source and percentage local contribution	1 pt/1% up to 50	0	25	23	24	20	requesting CFRP
						10		Good, but bothered by aim. "The primary objective of this proposed watershed improvement project is to demonstrate that forest watershed yield or supply can be increased through appropriate forest watershed management practices." Good science should ask "if", not attempt to show "can be increased."
6.a	Needs of historic, traditional uses and cultures	10	5	5	10		5	"should increase"
6.b	Needs of current and future demands for water	20	5	10	15	15	10	
6.c	Flood control	20	5	5	5	20	10	depends on Rx
6.d	Fire protection, prevention, suppression	20	5	15	20	20	20	
6.e	Recreation	20	5	5	5	20	10	
6.f	Environmental protection	20	5	10	20	20	10	
6.g	Other	10		10	5	10		
7	Other entity support for proposal	40	10	10	40	40	40	some letters are for different project
8	Counties benefitting	10/county to 40	20	10	10	10	10	
9	Economic growth or benefit for interests	10/interest to 50	10	25	50	50	50	